



HOW TO CRITICALLY ANALYZE INFORMATION SOURCES

Evaluating a source can begin even before you have the source in hand. You can initially appraise a source by first **examining the bibliographic citation**. A bibliographic citation is a written description of a book, journal article, essay, or some other published material. Bibliographic citations characteristically have three main components: author, title, and publication information. These components can help you determine the usefulness of this source for your paper.

INITIAL APPRAISAL

Author

What are the author's credentials--educational background, past writings, or experience--in this area? Is the book or article written on a topic in the author's area of expertise? **Who's Who in America** or the biographical information located in the publication itself can be used to determine the author's credentials.

Has your instructor mentioned this author? Have you seen the author's name cited in other sources or bibliographies? Respected authors are cited frequently by other scholars. For this reason, always note those names that appear in many different sources.

Year of Publication

When was the source published? This date is often located on the face of the title page below the name of the publisher. If it is not there, look for the copyright date on the reverse of the title page.

Is the source current or out-of-date for your topic? Topic areas of continuing and rapid development, such as the sciences, demand more current information. On the other hand, topics in the humanities often require material that was written many years ago.

Edition

Is this a first edition or not? Further editions indicate a source has been revised and updated to reflect changes in knowledge, include omissions, and to harmonize with its intended readers' needs. Also, many printings or editions may indicate that the work has become a standard source in the area and is reliable.

Publisher

Note the publisher. If the source is published by a university press, it is likely to be scholarly. Although the fact that the publisher is reputable does not necessarily guarantee quality, it does show that the publisher may have high regard for the source being published.

Title of Journal

Is this a scholarly or a popular journal? This distinction is important because it is indicative of different levels of complexity in conveying ideas. If you need help in determining the type of journal, check your journal title in Katz's Magazines for Libraries (REF 011.34 K19) for a brief evaluative description.

CONTENT ANALYSIS

Having made an initial appraisal, you should now examine the body of the source. Read the Preface to determine the author's intentions for the book, scan the Table of Contents and the Index to get a broad overview of the material it covers. Note whether bibliographies are included. Read the chapters that specifically address your topic.

Intended Audience

What type of audience is the author addressing? Is the publication aimed at a specialized or a general audience? Is this source too elementary, too technical, too advanced, or just right for your needs?

Objective Reasoning

Is the information covered fact, opinion, or propaganda? It is not always easy to separate fact from opinion. Facts can usually be verified; opinions, though they may be based on factual information, evolve from the interpretation of facts. Skilled writers can make you think their interpretations are facts.

Does the information appear to be valid and well-researched, or is it questionable and unsupported by evidence? Assumptions should be reasonable. Note errors or omissions.

Is the author's point of view objective and impartial? Is the language free of emotion-rousing words and bias?

Coverage

Does the work update other sources, substantiate other materials you have read, or add new information? Does it extensively or marginally cover your topic? You should explore enough sources to obtain a variety of viewpoints.

Is the material primary or secondary in nature? Primary sources are the raw material of the research process. Secondary sources are based on primary sources. For example, if you were researching Adenauer's role in rebuilding West Germany, Adenauer's own writings would be one of many primary sources available on this topic. Others might include relevant government documents and contemporary German newspaper articles. Scholars use this primary material to help generate historical interpretations--a secondary source. Books, encyclopedia articles, and scholarly journal articles about Adenauer's role would be considered secondary sources. Choose both primary and secondary sources when you have the opportunity.

Writing Style

Is the publication organized logically? Are the main points clearly presented? Do you find the text easy to read, or is it stilted or choppy? Is the author repetitive?

Evaluative Reviews

Locate critical reviews of books in a reviewing source, such as **Library Journal**, **Book Review Index** or **Book Review Digest**. Is the review positive? Is the book under review considered a valuable contribution to the field? Does the reviewer mention other books that might be better? If so, locate these sources for more information on your topic.

Do the various reviewers agree on the value or attributes of the book or has it aroused controversy among the critics?

*Adapted from materials developed by the URIS Undergraduate Library, Cornell University.

EVALUATING INTERNET SOURCES

When exploring Internet sites, a researcher should add or modify the following criteria to those described above:

Author

This may not be as clearly stated as in print sources. Frequently, it appears at the end of the document, instead of the beginning. Is the author qualified to be 'an authority' on the topic of the website?

Year of Publication

This may be worded "date the information was last updated." Do not confuse this date, or the date the document was originally created, with the last time the browser visited the site. The date of creation or date of last update should be stated somewhere in the source.

Objective Reasoning

Since anyone may publish on the Internet, it is therefore crucial for any researcher to determine the author's reasons and bias for writing his document.

Writing Style and Ease of Use

In electronic style, important considerations are the ease of navigation, the effectiveness of the arrangement of items, and the clarity of the icons. These components, plus links and graphics, should combine to facilitate researcher's use of the site.

For more information regarding the evaluation of Internet Sources, see the following site:

http://www.sasked.gov.sk.ca/curr_inst/iru/webeval.html